

Personal Information:

Anita Derks
62 Ulysses Road
RD 10
Palmerston North 4470

Introduction

I want NZ to be a 'safe, green country' and that we are seen as a country with minimal inequities (OECD Better Life Index 2020)¹.

The reality is that there is a growing threat to our safety and health from energy security and affordability, and that inequities are significant, particularly for those on low income and for elderly, disabled, Māori and people of the Pacific.² New Zealanders are earning less per household than other OECD households and spending more on a roof over their heads.¹ Households with little cash income cannot afford adequate heating during winter, and homeowners, who in addition, cannot afford home improvements such as insulation.

My recommendation focuses on improving the wellbeing and negative health impacts of living in a cold home (18°C or less) by promoting a preventable action that can remedy this. Cold homes create illnesses, stresses on healthcare providers, reduction in workplace productivity, and increasing school absences. My philosophy is that everyone has the right to live in a warm, dry home. I argue that by providing affordable electricity supply, homes will be warmer leading to more available disposable income resulting in better healthcare and in a manner that will benefit the environment.

My submission is to the Electricity Authority (EA) who is looking at potential issues on distribution networks and a range of potential regulatory options that may be needed to the regulation of distribution networks to support New Zealand's transition to a low-emissions economy and ensure long-term benefits to consumers. In the context of energy access and affordability, the EA thus has the most power to facilitate change in electricity supply and affordability, the key tenet of my proposal.

References for Introduction:

- 1 Organisation for Economic Development (OECD) 2020, <https://www.oecd.org/els/family/HC1-2-Housing-costs-over-income.pdf>Better Life Index.
- 2 Ministry of Health, 2021. Health and Independence Report 2019. <https://www.health.govt.nz/publication/health-and-independence-report-2019>

Submission to the

Electricity Authority on Updating Regulatory settings for Distribution Networks

I thank the EA for calling for submissions and to improving competition and supporting a low emissions economy to benefit consumers.

The focus of my submission is on the potential regulatory options regarding domestic electricity affordability for over 40% of New Zealanders who are having difficulty affording the basic necessities, including a roof over their heads, who are cash-poor and are unable to keep their homes warm when it is cold.

My submission discusses the root cause and impact on many families and communities who do not have enough money left over from rent, food and medical costs to pay the electricity bill if they are to keep their home warm. I pose a solution and the measures to verify the effectiveness of my solution.

The Current Problem - A Warm Dry Home Initiative

Many New Zealand homes are cold because households cannot afford to pay for the electricity to heat their homes. Various surveys show that a third of New Zealand's homes are cold and damp^{1,6} and this is making people sick with cold related illnesses. Additionally, when it is very cold in the home, people die.^{3, 14} NZ homes are colder than the WHO recommended minimum of 18°C and possibly much colder in bedrooms as heating in bedrooms is uncommon.² Many of those affected by cold and damp homes are socioeconomically disadvantaged³ such as those in homes that are rented, the elderly and those with disabilities. Further, it is likely that 19% of acute respiratory illnesses in children are a result of living in a cold, damp home.^{2,9,12,13} The Child Poverty Monitor from Otago University⁸ estimate that 282,228 children live in damp homes and additionally that about 40,000 hospital admissions of children are likely to be linked to cold and damp homes.^{2,8,9}

There are several remedies already in place and being implemented to address the problem of cold homes, notably the Healthy Homes Act; various schemes and subsidies (EECA the Warmer Kiwi Homes Initiative, local councils, community groups) for installation of insulation and clean energy space heating; and the winter heating supplements for social welfare beneficiaries. Specifically, the Healthy Homes Act requirements and insulation and space heater insulation subsidies, aim to provide better quality homes. However, when people are cash poor, hard choices on how the money is spent must be made and home upgrades (for home owning households) and electricity expenditure for all cash poor families are sacrificed for more critical needs such as rent, rates, a mortgage and food.

Cash poor households cannot afford to heat their homes and in the case of homeowner households, cannot afford to improve their homes with better insulation and environmentally friendly heating.

The Results of New Zealanders living in Cold Homes

Health and illnesses associated with living in a cold damp house, are remedied by multiple factors other than traditional healthcare¹ one of which is heating affordability via electricity. Electricity affordability most impacts low-income households, the elderly and those with disabilities who are the most financially disadvantaged. Notably, a high proportion of those earning below the median income include Māori and people of the Pacific, disabled people and the elderly.¹⁰ Warm homes must be a priority as illness due to living in the cold, places a huge burden on affected families and communities, on the health system and on the well-being and economic performance of New Zealand. More people are getting sick and more and more children are growing up with preventable illnesses which will affect them all their lives. Telfar⁹ highlighted that the hospitalisation rate was 75% higher in winter with a 20% excess in mortality, and a substantial increase in the 20 years from 1995 to 2005 with many of these being the elderly, infants and young children. Although there is no data for NZ, an Australian study found 217 people presented to emergency departments with hypothermia between 2009 and 2016 and, of those, 11% died. Nearly 80% suffered hypothermia from being inside and most were elderly.¹⁴

A significant proportion of household incomes are spent on housing ranging from 20% to over 42%⁷ which, when income is low and electricity charges are high, will result in households turning off space heaters. A pathway to a warm home that stimulates better health, therefore, is the reliability of electricity at an affordable price. Recent reliability issues such as power outages and electricity affordability, result in more cold homes and consequently more illnesses related to living in the cold. Recently the power was cut to about 20,000 homes on the 9th of August on the coldest night of the year. Are there more outages to come?

The impact of low capacity, poor infrastructure and higher electricity prices can be seen in a specific case in the USA. In February 2021 more than 4.5 million households (about 10 million people) in Texas lost power due to severe winter storms.⁵ As with other disasters those most affected were the most vulnerable, marginalised communities and those on lower incomes who lived in older, poorly insulated homes, and had limited resources to repair or improve their homes. The reports showed that these people were also most affected by limited employment, a burden of disease, and could not recover financially even to replace spoiled food. It was estimated that more than 111 people died during these Texas power outages by freezing to death in their own homes. In the Texas instance, more shocking was the reported 'hideous price hikes' from the generators selling to the retailers at the time, and the record profits made by investors. In Texas the pre-storm spot prices were at US\$30/MWh and went up to their cap of US\$9,000/MWh during the storm. Some retailers passed on this increase to their customers with some consumers receiving bills for over US\$10,000 for one week's supply and hence had little hope of paying.⁵

The Texas type power outages could easily happen in NZ, suggesting that cash poor households will then suffer even more. As NZ (appropriately) moves to carbon neutral energy, what is the cost to peoples' health and well-being for those who can least afford to

pay more? In NZ there has been no material increase in electricity generation recently, yet it is estimated that we will need three-fold more electricity generation if we are to fully replace fossil fuels,¹¹ which are often substituted for electricity by the poorer households. As always, as was highlighted in the recent Texas power cuts, in times of economic disasters the disadvantaged suffer the most and do not recover, so that must be remedied in NZ. A lesser, yet still impactful trend is already happening in NZ. In May this year prices ranged from 26c/kWh in Dunedin to 42c/kWh in Kerikeri and those paying the highest prices were in regions with the most economic deprivation, the least able to negotiate good pricing, and the furthest away from a generator in the West Coast, South Otago, Northland or Gisborne.⁴

Electricity security of supply at affordable prices for heating is one of the biggest threats to good health and well-being. Already this year during a short cold snap there were power cuts overnight on the coldest night of the year in some of the coldest parts of the North Island which could be an indicator that the power grid is at capacity. The EA's objective is to promote competition in, reliable supply by, and the efficient operation of, the electricity industry in New Zealand for the long-term benefit of consumers. Therefore, the EA is the most appropriate authority to address the issue of cash poor households being unable to afford electricity for warm homes.

Solutions for Warmer Homes – Electricity Enabled

Specific recommendation:

Create and implement a **Government Retail Electricity (GRE) provider** that provides:

1. no cost and low-cost electricity to households that are assessed as cash-poor;
2. a small, stepwise increase in tariff for electricity based on kWh limits per household in the winter months and in terms of climate location, that would be lower than other retailers currently charge.

To be eligible, householders must:

- meet criteria that assesses their inability to meet other commercial providers' retail electricity rates for the general population (i.e., those who can afford to pay);
- be living in homes that meet the Healthy Homes Standards (or homes that are in the process of being upgraded to these standards).

Notes to assist the implementation of an effective (GRE):

The GRE would be available nationally to defined domestic customers to enable sustained affordability to vulnerable New Zealanders. It will operate under the same regulations as other retailers where for the GRE, the main shareholder is the Government, and the principal funding comes from the Government.

The new GRE could be a role model for other retailers. For example:

- Electricity capacity, infrastructure and cost changes would place no further burden on households and would facilitate urgent transition to clean energy sources.
- The changes to clean energy, affordable and uninterrupted supply could include:
 - ripple control for hot water heating at low off-peak pricing to lessen peak demand,

- micro-generation systems (e.g., solar, wind) enabled in communities to serve the community first who can then sell excess electricity to the grid,
- uniform peak domestic pricing rolled out nationwide so that rural, remote and smaller communities are not disadvantaged.

Measures of Success – Affordable Electricity Results in Warm Homes which is Effective in Reducing Illness

The following success metrics for the new GRE could include:

- a. That 80% of eligible households are enrolled with GRE or take up a similar plan with a local Electricity Retailer within the first 24 months of operation.
- b. That homes in the program are at least 21°C in the living areas and at least 18°C in bedrooms when people are at home (as measured by self-report surveys). This is applicable when the outside temperature is below 18°C.
- c. That when surveyed, the people in Deprivation Index 1-2 Quintile groups pay no more than 9% of disposable income on adequate electricity and heating.
- d. The prevalence of illness and school absenteeism due to illness reduces, and the sick leave from work reduces both for parental care and for illness. This measure relies on reduction over the winter months year on year.
- e. Once established, power supply estimated to be cost neutral as the Pensioner winter subsidy is redirected on a need's (criteria) basis only, rather than currently paid to all pensioners.

Additionally, the Healthy Homes Act must be broadened to include measures of success for implementation and a method of assessing compliance that is regulated so that the GRE is providing electricity to homes that are insulated. Further, that upgraded homes are linked to affordable electricity schemes provided by the new GRE or equivalently priced retail suppliers, for low-income households, income support households, households with special needs individuals, and for needs assessed pensioners.

Acknowledgement

I would like to acknowledge the support in writing this submission is to Phillipa Howden-Chapman and the innovative and dedicated people of the Department of Public Health at Otago University Wellington who have opened my eyes to the possibility of having a voice to help all New Zealanders live in healthy, safe and warm homes.

References

- 1 Ministry of Health, 2021. *Health and Independence Report 2019*.
<https://www.health.govt.nz/publication/health-and-independence-report-2019>
- 2 Ingham, T., Keall, M., Jones, B., Aldridge, D., Dowell, A., Davies, C., Crane, J., Draper, J., Bailey, L., Viggers, H., Stanley, T., Leadbitter, P., Latimer, M., Howden-Chapman, P., 2010, *Damp mouldy housing and early childhood hospital admissions for acute respiratory infection: a case control study*. *Thorax* 2019; 74:849-857. doi:10.1136/thoraxjnl-2018-212979

- 3 Free, S., P Howden-Chapman, P., Pierse, N., Viggers, H., *The Housing, Heating and Health Study Research Team, 2010, More effective home heating reduces school absences for children with asthma.* Journal of Epidemiology & Community Health 2010; 64:379-386. doi:10.1136/jech.2008.086520
- 4 MBIE NZ, May 2021. *Quarterly Survey of Domestic Electricity Prices - Report for 15 May 2021. Electricity Cost and Price Monitoring.* <https://www.mbie.govt.nz/building-and-energy/energy-and-natural-resources/energy-statistics-and-modelling/energy-statistics/energy-prices/electricity-cost-and-price-monitoring/>
- 5 Busby, J., Baker, K., Bazilian, M., Gilbert, A, Grubert, E., Rai, V., Rhodes, J., Shidore, S., Smith, K., Webber, M., 2021, *Cascading risks: Understanding the 2021 winter blackout in Texas.* Energy Research & Social Science 2021; 77, July, 102106. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.erss.2021.102106>
- 6 Statistics NZ, 29 January 2020, *Around a third of homes too cold in winter and too warm in summer.* <https://www.stats.govt.nz/news/around-a-third-of-homes-too-cold-in-winter-and-too-warm-in-summer>
- 7 Organisation for Economic Development (OECD) 2020, *HC1.2. Housing Costs Over Income.* <https://www.oecd.org/els/family/HC1-2-Housing-costs-over-income.pdf>
- 8 Child Poverty Action Group (2021). *CPAG Reducing the health risks for children backgrounder_v2.* <https://www.cpag.org.nz/assets/>
- 9 Oliver, J., Foster, T., Kvalsvig, A., Williamson, D., Baker, M., Pierse, N., 2018. *Risk of rehospitalisation and death for vulnerable New Zealand children.* Arch Dis Child 2018; 103:327–334. doi:10.1136/archdischild-2017-312671
- 10 Salmond, C., Crampton, P., Atkinson, J. *NZDep2006 Index of Deprivation User's Manual;* Department of Public Health, University of Otago Wellington: Wellington, New Zealand, 2007.
- 11 MBIE NZ Markets and Insights Branch, August 2020. *Energy in New Zealand 20, 2019 Calendar Year Edition, Comprehensive information on and analysis of New Zealand's energy supply, demand and prices.* <https://www.mbie.govt.nz/dmsdocument/11679-energy-in-new-zealand-2020>
- 12 Baker, M., Telfar-Barnard, L., Kvalsvig, A., Zhang, J., Keall, M., Wilson, N., Wall, T., Howden-Baker, P., 2012. *Increasing incidence of serious infectious diseases and inequalities in New Zealand: a national epidemiological study.* The Lancet 2012, 379; 1112-1119. doi:10.1016/S0140-6736(11)61780-7
- 13 Telfar-Barnard, L., Bennett, J., Howden-Chapman, P., Jacobs, D., David Ormandy, D., Cutler-Welsh, M., Preval, N., Baker, M., Keall, M. 2017. *Measuring the Effect of Housing Quality Interventions: The Case of the New Zealand "Rental Warrant of Fitness".* International Journal of Environmental Research & Public Health 2017, 14, 1352 doi:10.3390/ijerph14111352
- 14 Forcey, D., FitzGerald, M., Burggraf, M., Nagalingam, V., Ananda-Rajah, M. *'Cold and lonely': emergency presentations of patients with hypothermia to a large Australian health network.* Internal Medicine Journal 50 (2020) 54–60. doi:10.1111/imj.14308